

## Immigrant women's perceptions and experiences of health care services: insights from a focus group study

Dias, Sónia; Gama, Ana; Rocha, Cristianne

Postprint / Postprint

Zeitschriftenartikel / journal article

Zur Verfügung gestellt in Kooperation mit / provided in cooperation with:

www.peerproject.eu

### Empfohlene Zitierung / Suggested Citation:

Dias, S., Gama, A., & Rocha, C. (2010). Immigrant women's perceptions and experiences of health care services: insights from a focus group study. *Journal of Public Health*, 18(5), 489-496. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10389-010-0326-x>

### Nutzungsbedingungen:

Dieser Text wird unter dem "PEER Licence Agreement zur Verfügung" gestellt. Nähere Auskünfte zum PEER-Projekt finden Sie hier: <http://www.peerproject.eu>. Gewährt wird ein nicht exklusives, nicht übertragbares, persönliches und beschränktes Recht auf Nutzung dieses Dokuments. Dieses Dokument ist ausschließlich für den persönlichen, nicht-kommerziellen Gebrauch bestimmt. Auf sämtlichen Kopien dieses Dokuments müssen alle Urheberrechtshinweise und sonstigen Hinweise auf gesetzlichen Schutz beibehalten werden. Sie dürfen dieses Dokument nicht in irgendeiner Weise abändern, noch dürfen Sie dieses Dokument für öffentliche oder kommerzielle Zwecke vervielfältigen, öffentlich ausstellen, aufführen, vertreiben oder anderweitig nutzen.

Mit der Verwendung dieses Dokuments erkennen Sie die Nutzungsbedingungen an.

**gesis**  
Leibniz-Institut  
für Sozialwissenschaften

### Terms of use:

This document is made available under the "PEER Licence Agreement". For more information regarding the PEER-project see: <http://www.peerproject.eu>. This document is solely intended for your personal, non-commercial use. All of the copies of this document must retain all copyright information and other information regarding legal protection. You are not allowed to alter this document in any way, to copy it for public or commercial purposes, to exhibit the document in public, to perform, distribute or otherwise use the document in public.

By using this particular document, you accept the above-stated conditions of use.

Mitglied der  
  
Leibniz-Gemeinschaft

Editorial Manager(tm) for Journal of Public Health  
Manuscript Draft

Manuscript Number: JOPH-D-09-00056R1

Title: Immigrant women's perceptions and experiences of health care services: Insights from a Focus Group Study

Article Type: Original Article

Corresponding Author: Prof. Sónia Dias,

Corresponding Author's Institution:

First Author: Sónia Dias, PhD

Order of Authors: Sónia Dias, PhD; Sónia Dias; Ana Gama, MsD; Cristianne Rocha, EdD

Abstract: Aim: This study aimed to describe perceptions and experiences related to access and utilization of health care services of African and Brazilian immigrant women in Portugal.

Subject and Methods: Six focus groups were conducted with 35 African and Brazilian women with low income and living in Lisbon, chosen through purposive sampling. Content analysis was undertaken through identification of themes and categories.

Results: African and Brazilian women expressed different perceptions and patterns of use of health care services. Most participants pointed out several barriers in access and utilization of services related to legal issues, economic constraints or health professionals' attitudes.

Conclusion: These results highlight the challenges for providing health care within a multicultural setting and the need of assuring integrated and comprehensive health care services. Improving access to general health care is essential to minimising disadvantage from vulnerable subgroups, like immigrant women. Supporting better integration into the health system may lead to greater health outcomes.

Response to Reviewers: See attachment.

Dear Editor,

Thank you very much for considering to accept, after revision, our manuscript named **Immigrant women's perceptions and experiences of health care services: Insights from a Focus Group Study**. We are grateful for the comments provided by the reviewers; we believe that these improved very much our new version of the manuscript and further clarified our thinking in this issue. We went through every comment and here we present our review of the previous version, indicating the changes proposed.

### **Abstract**

Regarding the suggestion “*page 1, line 31: "most participants pointed..." (...) it should be better to use the word "or" ["... legal issues, economic constraints, or health professionals attitudes."]*”, we changed the sentence as proposed by the reviewer.

### **Introduction**

We recognize the importance of adding some general information about the situation of immigration in Portugal. Therefore, we added in the Introduction section a description of the proportion of immigrants and immigrant women in Portugal. Also, to better clarify the choice of including in this study the two target groups, we referred that the most representative immigrant women groups in Portugal are from Brazil and Portuguese-speaking African countries. As regards the specific countries of origin of African participants, we added this information in the section of Socio-demographic characteristics of participants.

Taking into account the comments of the reviewers, we added a description of the Portuguese policy and rights regarding access to health services. We agree that such information certainly may be helpful for readers from outside Portugal.

We clarified the contribution of gender and migrant status to understanding differences in vulnerability to health and access to health care. Simultaneously, we took into account the comment of one reviewer who considered that in page 3, line 14, “*this part is redundant*”. So we revised this sentence. As suggested, references of quantitative data on access and utilization of health care services of immigrants in Portugal were added.

### **Methods and participants**

We revised the Methods and participants section and, as one reviewer proposed, described in more detail the sampling and mode of analysis of data. For better clarification of the procedure, we explained that in collaboration with the research team, several non governmental organizations, associations and social institutions working with immigrant communities identified potential participants according to the inclusion criteria (being from Brazil or Portuguese-speaking African countries, being 18-45 years old and residing in Portugal for at least two years). Afterward, the research team contacted these women in order to invite them to participate, to confirm inclusion criteria, to present briefly the project and to inform about logistics of focus groups (location, time, etc.). Women participated in the study according to their availability and interest to participate. In order to ensure the participation in focus groups, several telephone contacts were made to each participant, with a last contact made in the day before the session. [This information was added in the manuscript]. The focus groups were conducted with the participants who attended to the group sessions. Indeed, as one

of the reviewers underlined, each of the 3 groups with African participants comprised 6 or 7 women, and each of the 3 groups with Brazilian participants included 5 women.

As proposed by one reviewer, we revised the text and specified that informed consent was obtained before group discussions, in page 5 line 7.

We do agree that it would be interesting to have information about the religion of participants but unfortunately we did not collect data on this. Due to the sensitive nature of religion-related questions we avoided exploring this issue in the focus groups as it is often considered intrusive.

In relation to comment "*Page 5, line 55: 'Discussions .... between groups were compared ....' Have there been any discussion between the groups (e. g. between African and Brazilian immigrant groups)??*", in fact there was no discussion between the groups; we conducted 6 focus groups (3 with African women and 3 with Brazilian women). In order to clarify the sentence in the manuscript, we revised it explaining that firstly analyses focused on each focus group separately and then on the comparison between Brazilian and African groups.

## **Results**

The topic about "alternative medicine" was only slightly mentioned by participants in the focus groups and we did not explore this in the sessions. So unfortunately it is not possible to clarify such issues in this study as we did not collect information on what kind of alternative medicine women were referring to. Although, it would be very interesting to develop further research to better understand the use of alternative medicine by women.

*"Page 11, line 51 - 53: ". male health professionals have misinterpreted an offered gesture of gratitude." What does it mean exactly? Do You mean sexual trouble??".* Indeed, in group sessions several Brazilian women described episodes of sexual discrimination experienced in Portugal, besides color-based discrimination.

As the reviewer pointed out ("*Page 12, line 31*") the sentence was said by an African woman and not by a Brazilian, as mistakenly written. Thus it was amended in the manuscript.

## **Discussion**

Agreeing with the reviewers' comments that "*Many of the findings could also be true for the host population in Portugal*", we look in the scarce literature in Portugal about this topic and, in fact, the few studies conducted in Portugal with general population show similar constraints, namely the complex procedures to make an appointment and the long waiting time (Santos et al. 2007; Cabral et al. 2002). However, the findings of our study suggest that these issues may have particular impact for immigrant women as they frequently have poorer labour protection. In fact, participants stated that they have full-time jobs with inflexible working hours and it is impossible for them to take a day off from work. [This information was added in the manuscript].

In respect to the note "*Of course quantitative representativeness cannot be achieved in a study that aims to explore perceptions. Therefore a representative study for the general immigrant population would not only be difficult to carry out but also would*

*not serve the same purpose*”, we are totally in agreement with the reviewer. What we meant was that our findings cannot be generalized once a purposive sampling was used, but this, as the reviewer highlighted, is a characteristic of qualitative methodology. Therefore we considered to remove the sentence in page 16.

We completely agree with the reviewer ( “*Diversity management and cultural sensitivity are parts of the solution. But is an increasing of the utilization of the health system a solution (page 17, line 12)?*”). Our results show that promotion of access and utilization of health care services is important; however further efforts in other areas are needed, like the promotion of cultural sensitivity and competence of health professionals.

We changed the text according to the reviewers’ suggestions: we removed the extra spaces and the dot; we checked and changed the reference (indeed the author name in both cases is Geiger HJ); in Page 22, line 31 (“ *disparities in access.*”) we corrected the sentence and wrote “in” instead of “en”; and revised pages 8 and 15 for grammatical and vocabulary improvement.

Yours sincerely,

Sónia Dias

**Immigrant women's perceptions and experiences of health care services: Insights from a  
Focus Group Study**

Sónia Dias\*, Ana Gama\*\* & Cristianne Rocha\*\*\*

\* PhD, Institute of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, New University of Lisbon, Lisbon, Portugal.

\*\* MsD, Institute of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, New University of Lisbon, Lisbon, Portugal.

\*\*\* EdD, Brazil Lutheran University, Porto Alegre, Brazil

Corresponding Author:

Sónia Dias

Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical, Universidade Nova de Lisboa

Rua da Junqueira, 96

1349-008 Lisboa

Portugal

Tel: 00 351 21 3652600

Fax: 00 351 21 3632105

e-mail: [sfdias@ihmt.unl.pt](mailto:sfdias@ihmt.unl.pt), [smfdias@yahoo.com](mailto:smfdias@yahoo.com)

Ana Gama

Instituto de Higiene e Medicina Tropical

Universidade Nova de Lisboa

Rua da Junqueira, 96

1349-008 Lisboa

Portugal

Tel: 00 351 21 3652600

Fax: 00 351 21 3632105

e-mail: anafgama@gmail.com

Cristianne Rocha

Rua Irmão José Otão, 170 – Apto. 905

CEP: 90035-060 - Porto Alegre - RS

Brazil

Tel: 00 55 5132398001

Fax: 00 55 5132398001

e-mail: cristianne.rocha@terra.com.br

**Immigrant women’s perceptions and experiences of health care services: Insights from a  
Focus Group Study**

**Abstract**

**Aim:** This study aimed to describe perceptions and experiences related to access and utilization of health care services of African and Brazilian immigrant women in Portugal.

**Subject and Methods:** Six focus groups were conducted with 35 African and Brazilian women with low income and living in Lisbon, chosen through purposive sampling. Content analysis was undertaken through identification of themes and categories.

**Results:** African and Brazilian women expressed different perceptions and patterns of use of health care services. Most participants pointed out several barriers in access and utilization of services related to legal issues, economic constraints or health professionals’ attitudes.

**Conclusion:** These results highlight the challenges for providing health care within a multicultural setting and the need of assuring integrated and comprehensive health care services. Improving access to general health care is essential to minimising disadvantage from vulnerable subgroups, like immigrant women. Supporting better integration into the health system may lead to greater health outcomes.

**Key Words:** Immigrant women, perceptions, experiences, access and utilization of health care services



## Introduction

The increasing number of immigrants in Europe poses new challenges to host countries on how to achieve better social integration for these populations (Eurostat 2006).

Recent data indicates that the proportion of women migrating to Europe has growing and becoming higher than men (United Nations 2005). In Portugal, the official data indicate that among immigrants - 6.1% of the total population - 45% is female (SEF 2008). Currently, the countries of origin of the most representative immigrant women groups in Portugal are Brazil and Portuguese-speaking African countries (SEF 2008).

Female migration has been recognized as an important challenge for public health as increasing evidence points out that migration can adversely affect health of migrant women (UNFPA 2006; UNFPA/IOM 2006). When arriving in a new country, immigrants often face a different social, structural and cultural context which frequently exposes them to risk factors with impact in health status (Dias et al. 2008; Fennelly 2004). Although this applies to both men and women, analysis from a gender perspective highlights that immigrant women are more likely to be in socially disadvantaged situations as poverty, social exclusion, irregular administrative situation and poor social and labour protection, rendering them more vulnerable (Llácer et al. 2007; Pécoud and Guchteneire 2004).

Some researches report that the health risk is partly associated with limited access and utilization of health services (Politzer et al. 2001; Stronks et al. 2001). Studies indicate that in several host countries, even in those where access to health care is guaranteed, immigrant women do not regularly benefit of the health care services available and often are not covered by services for information, prevention and treatment (Fennelly 2004; Goddard and Smith 2001; Scheppers et al. 2006).

1  
2  
3  
4 The Portuguese Constitution establishes that all citizens – including immigrants – have  
5  
6 the right to be attended in National Health Service (NHS) and in principle, health care should be  
7  
8 available to every person according to need, irrespective of nationality, legal status or any other  
9  
10 criterion. According to current legislation, persons without a NHS card (those without a  
11  
12 residency or work visa) or who do not pay social security must pay the full fare for services.  
13  
14  
15 However, there are some exceptions: in case of a public health threat, children under 12 years of  
16  
17 age, pregnant women and recent mothers, users of family planning programs, unemployed  
18  
19 registered at a job centre and their dependants, recipients of welfare benefits and individuals with  
20  
21 legally recognized chronic diseases. Despite of the efforts undertaken, the available data indicate  
22  
23 that migrants residing in Portugal still face difficulties in accessing and utilizing health services  
24  
25 (Gonçalves et al. 2003; Machado et al. 2006). A recent study on health care utilization among  
26  
27 immigrants in Portugal showed that 17.5% of female participants have never used health services  
28  
29 (Dias et al. 2008).  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34

35  
36 Although immigrant women are more likely to utilize health care services than men due  
37  
38 to women's longer life span and reproductive health needs (Parslow et al. 2004), they are also  
39  
40 more likely to postpone receiving health care because usually they have fewer financial  
41  
42 resources to pay for health care (Jatrana and Crampton 2009; Ranji et al. 2007). Other studies  
43  
44 have reported that immigrant women often experience lower levels of education, precarious  
45  
46 employment and irregular administrative status, which have been identified as barriers in  
47  
48 accessing health care services (Grieco 2002; Marshall et al. 2005). In addition, gender  
49  
50 inequalities related to social roles and cultural norms may limit women's access to health care  
51  
52 (Lane and Cibula 2000).  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

1  
2  
3  
4 In summary, a growing body of research has acknowledging that utilization of health  
5  
6 services among immigrants is a product of a dynamic interaction between multiple factors.  
7  
8

9 The increasing proportion of immigrant women worldwide, the reported barriers in access  
10  
11 and utilization of health care services among this group and the lack of information on these  
12  
13 issues suggest that deeper knowledge is needed. It is important to assess women's perceptions  
14  
15 and perceived needs concerning health care to better understand the challenges they face in  
16  
17 accessing and using health care services. Research on access and utilization of health care  
18  
19 services of immigrants has based mainly on quantitative data (Dias et al. 2008; Marshall et al.  
20  
21 2005; Stronks et al. 2001); lack of information on women's perspectives on these issues remains.  
22  
23 Qualitative research may contribute to deeply understand immigrant women's perspectives on  
24  
25 health care services and explore cultural differences associated with these issues (Green and  
26  
27 Thorogood 2004).  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32

33 This study aimed to describe perceptions and experiences related to access and utilization  
34  
35 of health care services of African and Brazilian immigrant women in Portugal.  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

## Methods and Participants

To deeply understand migrants' perspectives on health care services, a qualitative research method using focus group was chosen. Focus group is recognized as an important technique for working in a diverse cultural setting, providing rich and valuable information (Culley et al. 2007). Furthermore, synergistic effects of the group setting bring out ideas and discussion that do not arise in individual interviews (Kidd and Parshall 2000).

### Sampling and recruitment

Six focus groups were conducted with 35 immigrant women with low income living in Lisbon, chosen through purposive sampling.

In collaboration with the research team, several non governmental organizations, associations and social institutions working with immigrant communities identified potential participants according to the following inclusion criteria: being from Brazil or Portuguese-speaking African countries, being 18-45 years old and residing in Portugal for at least two years. Afterward, the research team contacted these women in order to invite them to participate, to confirm inclusion criteria, to present briefly the project and to inform about logistics of focus groups (location, time, etc.). Women participated in the study according to their availability and interest to participate. In order to ensure the participation in focus groups, several telephone contacts were made to each participant, with a last contact made in the day before the session. Three focus groups were conducted with each group (African and Brazilian).

## **Procedure**

At the beginning of each focus group session, participants were fully informed about the purpose of the project, the procedure of data collection and how discussion would be conducted. Participants were clearly told that they might choose not to participate or quit at any moment during the group session. Anonymity and confidentiality of data were guaranteed, and informed and voluntary consent was obtained.

A semi-structured topic guide was used to conduct focus group sessions, covering all relevant topics and allowing the discussion to flow naturally. Focus groups were facilitated by a member of the research team and a co-moderator acting as a non-participant observer. Each discussion was audio taped using a digital recorder to maximize data collection and help to transcribe discussions for analysis. Field notes were taken to describe emergent themes and body language of participants. Focus groups were conducted between May and June of 2008. Group discussions lasted an average of one-and-a-half hour.

After group discussions, a questionnaire was applied for participants' socio-demographic characterization; it included information about age, country of origin, nationality, immigration status, educational level, employment status and length of stay in Portugal.

The study was approved by the Ethical Committee of the Institute of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine, New University of Lisbon.

## **Analysis of data**

All discussions were transcribed, and transcripts were verified through audiotape recordings for accuracy. Data was analyzed according to content analysis procedure commonly used in qualitative methodology (Krueger and Casey 2000; Morgan 2002). The analysis began

1  
2  
3  
4 by reading through the transcripts and listening to the audio records, in order to identify the  
5  
6 relevant ideas and concepts emerged in the group sessions. On the basis of the thematic topics,  
7  
8 initial categories were created that later evolved and changed even during the analysis.  
9  
10  
11 Afterward, two independent investigators coded and organized data according to these  
12  
13 categories. The opinions of participants on the different themes were analyzed taking into  
14  
15 account the group agreements and individual contributions. Coded transcripts were reviewed and  
16  
17 overall there was high agreement between researchers. In the few cases where agreement was not  
18  
19 achieved, a discussion was held between all investigators to resolve inconsistencies of  
20  
21 interpretation. Firstly, the analyses focused on each focus group separately and then on the  
22  
23 comparison between African and Brazilian groups.  
24  
25  
26  
27

28 To maintain participants' confidentiality, names of individuals and institutions were not  
29  
30 included in transcripts and all participants are referred as either women or participants in this  
31  
32 article. Quotes were chosen to best illustrate the themes emerging from data analysis.  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

## Results

### Socio-demographic characteristics of participants

Among participants, 20 were African and 15 were Brazilian (Table 1). Among the African participants, nine were from Cape Verde, six from Angola, four from Sao Tome and Principe and one from Guinea. The mean age of African participants was 38.5 years (SD=6.8) while Brazilian participants' mean age was 30.9 years (SD=7.8).

Three African women and one Brazilian reported to have also Portuguese nationality. Among the others, 13 African women and nine Brazilian reported to have legal status. Length of stay in Portugal varied between 2 and 20 years, with most African women residing for more than 10 years in Portugal while all Brazilian women resided for less than 10 years. African participants reported lower educational level when compared to Brazilian. The great majority of participants (n=33) reported to be employed (18 African and 15 Brazilian women).

### Findings of focus group discussions

The content analysis of discussions' transcripts enabled to describe attitudes and practices of participants with regard to access and utilization of health care services. The main themes emerged are highlighted below.

#### Patterns of use of health care services

Different patterns of health care services utilization were described throughout the focus group discussions. Several women reported to use health care services in a preventive and regular way, emphasizing the importance of medical care through regular appointments. In

1  
2  
3  
4 contrast, some women mentioned that they only use health care services when they are ill. The  
5  
6 use of health care services for sexual and reproductive health was also discussed by participants.  
7  
8 Despite recognizing the importance of medical guidance, several women stated a non-regular use  
9  
10 of health care services and uptake of clinical tests in this area. In particular African women  
11  
12 described that they rarely attend family planning and prenatal care services: “*I don’t attend*  
13  
14 *family planning, I don’t do that.*” (African participant); “*I go to the doctor at four months of*  
15  
16 *pregnancy.*” (African participant). Other participants also reported the non use of health care  
17  
18 services.  
19  
20  
21  
22

23  
24 In the majority of focus group discussions, participants mentioned the use of different  
25  
26 types of health care services, pointing out several reasons for their option: “*Most of the times I*  
27  
28 *wait until my husband takes me to the hospital, so I can take all the exams that I need.*” (African  
29  
30 participant); “*The assistance at the health centre is excellent (...) however at the hospital,*  
31  
32 *honestly, I’m afraid (...) they aren’t so cautious.*” (Brazilian participant). An interesting aspect  
33  
34 raised by Brazilian participants was their frequent use of health care services in their country of  
35  
36 origin, through medical appointments when they travel to Brazil during vacations or medical  
37  
38 orientation by telephone (often, they rely on relatives to make this contact).  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44

#### 45 46 **Comparison between provision of health care in the country of origin and in** 47 48 **Portugal** 49

50  
51 In all focus group discussions with African women, the provision of health care in  
52  
53 Portugal was considered more efficient than in the country of origin.  
54

55  
56 Differences between health care in the country of origin and in the host country were  
57  
58 mainly explored in group discussions with Brazilian women. In these sessions, participants  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65



1  
2  
3  
4 pointed out health care strategies that are undertaken in Brazil but, according to participants,  
5  
6 lack in Portugal: *“In Brazil the family doctor or nurse goes to our house once a month and check*  
7  
8 *if everything is in order. (...) At the health centre they have a medical record of my family (...)*  
9  
10 *that’s what I call family medicine, and it’s not what they do here.” (Brazilian participant).*  
11  
12

13  
14 Brazilian participants also discussed the lower frequency of tests, the higher prescription  
15  
16 of medication and the lack of reliance on alternative medicine in Portugal: *“The test [Pap*  
17  
18 *smear] is done every two years, but in Brazil we have to do it every six months. Here, my doctor*  
19  
20 *says it is not necessary.” (Brazilian participant); “In Brazil, they don’t prescribe so many*  
21  
22 *antibiotics as it happens here. (...) Brazil is more evolved when it comes to alternative*  
23  
24 *medicine.” (Brazilian participant).*  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30

### 31 **Perceptions of health care services**

32  
33 During discussions, several participants revealed to dislike and fear using health care  
34  
35 services: *“I don’t like to go to the doctor, I have phobia of hospitals, the smell, I don’t like it, I*  
36  
37 *faint instantly.” (African participant).* Mostly Brazilian participants described negative  
38  
39 experiences in health care services expressing mistrust and the perception of poor quality of the  
40  
41 delivered health care: *“they put everyone in a large room, there isn’t any privacy. Worse than*  
42  
43 *having no privacy is to hear other women screaming.” (Brazilian participant).* Also, for some  
44  
45 Brazilian participants, preventive medicine is not valued in Portugal. They described that  
46  
47 sometimes doctors criticize patients’ initiative to request for tests and exams: *“When I went to*  
48  
49 *the doctor and asked her for exams, she questioned everything: ‘Why did you asked for blood*  
50  
51 *tests? Why do you want to do a mammogram?’ I don’t think they should do that... I felt*  
52  
53 *criticized.” (Brazilian participant).*  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

## Barriers in access and utilization of health care services

An issue frequently discussed by participants in group sessions was the existing barriers in access and utilization of health care services. In general, Brazilian participants expressed the difficulties faced in accessing health care services “*when you have no documents*”, and it was perceptible how this issue may affect the utilization of such services: “*When I was illegal (...) I had to pay for everything in private medicine.*” (Brazilian participant); “*When you are illegal, they send you to the emergency service. It is no use going to the health centre.*” (Brazilian participant). In contrast, African participants considered that immigration status had no implications in access to health care services in Portugal: “*Before my legal status, I always had a family doctor, with or without legal documents I always had a doctor for my children and for me.*” (African participant).

Several women pointed out the complex procedures and the long waiting time to make medical appointments: “*it take too much time to make a medical appointment (...) you have to get a ticket, come back for the appointment, schedule the exam and then come back another day.*” (Brazilian participant). Discussions revealed that for some participants having to miss work to attend a medical appointment often hinders the use of health care services. Women suggested that the working hours of the services should be extended in order to overcome time constraints: “*To attend a medical appointment, I have to miss a day of work. I have two jobs (...) so I have to compromise both.*” (Brazilian participant); “*I don’t like to miss work, even when I’m ill; if I’m able to stand up I’ll go to work.*” (Brazilian participant); “*There should be a health centre opened at least until midnight*” (African participant). Several women also expressed that the cost associated with health care often influences which services they decide to

1  
2  
3  
4 use: *“Maybe it is better at the hospital because you pay what everyone else pays but at the health*  
5  
6 *centre you have to pay over 32 Euros.” (African participant).*  
7  
8

9 Another barrier pointed out as affecting women’s use of health care services was the  
10 attitudes of health professionals. Several participants complained about the way they are treated  
11 by administrative staff: *“The women who work at the reception have no education; they are very*  
12 *rude.” (Brazilian participant); “The way they treat us, sometimes they are so arrogant that I*  
13 *don’t feel like waiting.” (African participant).* In addition, women mentioned constraints in the  
14 doctor-patient relationship emphasizing the lack of attention of doctors: *“I went to the health*  
15 *centre (...) [the doctor] let me in, looked at the paper and didn’t even look at me. I think that*  
16 *some attention is needed.” (Brazilian participant).* Furthermore, for some participants health  
17 professionals are insensitive to the condition of being an immigrant: *“You go through many*  
18 *difficulties here, you may be alone and I think they don’t care about that.” (Brazilian*  
19 *participant).* During the focus group discussions, several women expressed the importance of a  
20 more sensitive approach to immigration-related issues in health care services. Participants also  
21 argued that health professionals should be trained to deal with cultural diversity and considered  
22 that such strategy could increase the utilization of health care services.  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42

43 Another issue discussed mainly by Brazilian participants was related to the set of  
44 stereotypes that frequently health professionals hold with regard to Brazilian women.  
45 Participants described situations where health professionals have implied that Brazilian women  
46 have more diseases than residents and others where male health professionals have  
47 misinterpreted an offered gesture of gratitude.  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54

55 During group discussions, participants mentioned that they have experienced  
56 discrimination in health care services revealing that those negative experiences often lead to an  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

1  
2  
3  
4 under use or even non use of the services: *“The nurse said: ‘Damn! You were so much better in*  
5 *your country and you came here to have your child?’ That comment was very unfortunate and it*  
6 *was very disturbing.” (Brazilian participant); “I didn’t get to be attended and I went home*  
7 *feeling worse (...) so I have never returned there [the service].” (Brazilian participant).*  
8  
9

10  
11 In focus group sessions, African women said that usually African immigrants do not  
12  
13 consider the use of health care services important: *“This happens very often, Africans think that*  
14 *they are their own doctors.” (African participant).* Through group discussions it was perceptible  
15  
16 the influencing role of cultural factors on women’s use of health care services. Several African  
17  
18 participants mentioned that certain attitudes of their male partners concerning the use of sexual  
19  
20 and reproductive health services often affect women’s utilization of such services: *“I have a*  
21 *friend whose husband dislikes the fact of her going to the doctor. Machismo...to show that he is*  
22 *above her, that he is in charge.” (African participant).* Participants also referred that  
23  
24 misinformation about their health rights and requirements to use health care services difficult the  
25  
26 access to these services.  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37

38 Despite the negative experiences described by most participants, a small group of women  
39  
40 considered that the barriers they face as immigrants are the same encountered by Portuguese  
41  
42 women and reported positive experiences on health care services, emphasizing the importance of  
43  
44 the provided social support.  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

## Discussion

The results of this study suggest different patterns of utilization of health care services among immigrant women from using on a regular basis to not using at all, consistently with previous studies (Aroian 2005; Geiger 2006). These results highlight the challenges for providing health care within a multicultural setting and the need of assuring integrated and comprehensive health care services.

Different opinions were found among African and Brazilian women about the provision of health care in Portugal compared to the country of origin. Some explanations can be put forward to explain these results. Some authors refer that women's perspectives on the delivered health care and the degree of satisfaction with the health system are strongly influenced by their expectations of care and previous experiences in the country of origin (Gurman and Becker 2008; Sofaer and Firminger 2005). Therefore, it is possible to admit that among participants, those from countries that lack health care structures may perceive health care services in Portugal as of higher quality while others from countries with a more efficient health system may perceive those services as less competent, like previous studies suggest (Dias et al. 2008; Gurman and Becker 2008).

Participants' perceptions of health care services in Portugal were further explored in focus group discussions. Several women revealed to dislike, mistrust and fear using health care services. Other authors have reported that populations tend to mistrust a health system that is not familiar (Ingleby et al. 2005; Manfellotto 2002). Culture and ethnicity may play an important role in producing social perceptions related to health as it creates a unique pattern of beliefs about what health means that shapes how symptoms are recognized and interpreted, and affects how and when health care services are used (Anderson et al. 2003).

1  
2  
3  
4 Barriers in access and utilization of health care services such as legal, structural,  
5  
6 socioeconomic and related to professionals' attitudes were pointed out by participants, as in  
7  
8 previous research (Fennelly 2004; Scheppers et al. 2006). Mainly Brazilian women considered  
9  
10 immigration status as a key factor in access to health care services describing that frequently  
11  
12 access to services was restricted when they were undocumented. In contrast, mostly African  
13  
14 women considered that there are no difficulties in accessing health care services in Portugal  
15  
16 regardless immigration status. The different opinions on this issue may be partly due to the fact  
17  
18 that among the sample, African participants reported higher length of stay in Portugal than  
19  
20 Brazilian women. The length of stay has been positively associated with integration in the host  
21  
22 country and specifically with knowledge on the health system and utilization of the health  
23  
24 services (Dias et al. 2008; Leduc and Proulx 2004). Therefore, it is possible to speculate that in  
25  
26 our sample African participants are better informed about the health system and their rights in  
27  
28 access to health care services (access to health care is guaranteed in Portugal). These findings  
29  
30 also suggest the need to increase women's awareness about their entitlement to, and the benefits  
31  
32 of health care services as misinformation about immigrants' health rights and the requirements  
33  
34 to use health care services was perceptible among participants, as in previous research (Ingleby  
35  
36 et al. 2005; Manfellotto 2002).

37  
38 Other barriers mentioned by participants included the cost of health care services.  
39  
40 Financial constraints may impede migrants' access to the optimal health care as migrants often  
41  
42 have poor socioeconomic conditions than the majority population (Norredam et al. 2007).  
43  
44 Several participants also complained about the restricted working hours of health care services,  
45  
46 the complex procedures to make appointments and the long waiting time. It is interesting to note  
47  
48 that such constraints have been also documented in previous studies on utilization of health care  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

1  
2  
3  
4 services among Portuguese citizens (Cabral et al. 2002; Santos et al. 2007). Nevertheless, our  
5  
6 findings suggest that these issues may differentially affect immigrant women as they often have  
7  
8 poorer labour protection. In fact, participants stated that frequently they have full-time jobs with  
9  
10 inflexible working hours and it is impossible for them to take a day off from work, which has  
11  
12 been referred in other researches (Dias et al. 2008; Fennelly 2004). Indeed, participants  
13  
14 suggested that the working hours of the services should be extended in order to overcome time  
15  
16 constraints.  
17  
18  
19  
20

21           As in previous studies, several participants have identified stereotyped and discriminatory  
22  
23 attitudes of health professionals, which include lack of sympathy, use of discriminatory language  
24  
25 or even hostile attitudes toward immigrants (Campayo et al. 2006; Michaelsen et al. 2004).  
26  
27 These factors have been considered as major barriers to the utilization of health care services  
28  
29 because often result in patients' delay or refusal to seek needed care (Geiger 2001; LaVeist et al.  
30  
31 2000; Lillie-Blanton et al. 2000). According to previous researches, and as participants pointed  
32  
33 out, negative attitudes of health professionals may reflect their inability to deal with cultural  
34  
35 diversity and their lack of sensitivity about immigrants' social and cultural beliefs related to  
36  
37 health and health care (Dawson and Gifford 2001; Kwok and Sullivan 2007). An important  
38  
39 component of promotion of access to care for culturally diverse populations is the cultural  
40  
41 competence of health systems. Interventions to promote such competence like training of health  
42  
43 professionals to deal with cultural diversity should be developed to improve providers' cultural  
44  
45 sensitivity, to help providing a welcoming health care environment for patients and therefore  
46  
47 improve utilization of health care services and quality of care (Anderson et al. 2003; Betancourt  
48  
49 et al. 2005).  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

1  
2  
3  
4 The findings also suggest that the choices related to the utilization of health care services  
5  
6 are mostly framed in the social context through cultural, social and family ties (Scheppers et al.  
7  
8 2006). Indeed, previous studies refer that cultural background has an important influence on  
9  
10 people's health beliefs and health-related behaviour (Anderson et al. 2003; Kwok and Sullivan  
11  
12 2007).  
13  
14

15  
16 Our results may have implications for future applied research on the quality of health care  
17  
18 services. Some women expressed high levels of satisfaction with their care, yet when asked for  
19  
20 details, they described various problems related with health care services. This phenomenon, also  
21  
22 recognized by other researchers (Staniszewska and Henderson 2004; Williams et al. 1998),  
23  
24 suggests that using qualitative research methods is important to study patients' experiences with  
25  
26 care because these methods rely on listening to patients' accounts and provide more detailed  
27  
28 information about their experiences (Avis 1997; Scrimshaw et al. 1997). Such research may  
29  
30 benefit the health system and patients as it can lead to ideas about ways in which health care  
31  
32 could be improved.  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37

38 Our study had some limitations that should be recognized when interpreting the results.  
39  
40 The main limitation is related with those of qualitative methodology. The group dynamic of  
41  
42 focus groups may inhibit individual expression of opinions and experiences that are not  
43  
44 consistent with those from the majority of participants. Despite the limitations, our study  
45  
46 strengthens the current literature with regard to patterns of use and barriers in access and  
47  
48 utilization of health care services among immigrant women, and relevant strategies to improve  
49  
50 health care among these groups.  
51  
52  
53  
54

55 In conclusion, the ultimate goal of health care services administrators and health  
56  
57 professionals should be to ensure that all people are able to access and gain benefits from the  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65



1  
2  
3  
4 health system. Improving access to general health care, including health promotion and  
5  
6 prevention, is essential to minimising disadvantage from vulnerable subgroups like immigrant  
7  
8 women, as supporting better integration into the health system may lead to greater health  
9  
10 outcomes. Part of the solution to reduce barriers in access to health care for immigrants and  
11  
12 increase its utilization will involve providing more responsive services, which includes  
13  
14 promoting culturally friendly services and combating discrimination. The needs of immigrants,  
15  
16 particularly women, must be given special attention and therefore specific and innovative  
17  
18 strategies to promote communities' participation should be developed. Immigrant community's  
19  
20 involvement in the planning and development of strategies to promote utilization of health care  
21  
22 services may be an essential strategy to improve health outcomes for these populations and help  
23  
24 to achieve better social integration.  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

## **Acknowledgements**

This work was supported by Fundação para a Ciência e a Tecnologia (IME/SAU-ESA/81760/2006). The authors wish to thank to all women who participated in the study for sharing their life experiences, perspectives and opinions. The authors wish to acknowledge valuable feedback and reviews provided by Prof. Gilles Dussault.

## **Conflict of interests**

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

## References

- Anderson LM, Scromshaw SC, Fullilove MT, Fielding JE, Normand J, Task Force on Community Preventive Services (2003) Culturally competent healthcare systems: A systematic review. *Am J Prev Med* 24(3S):68-77. doi:10.1016/S0749-3797(02)00657-8
- Aroian K (2005) Equity, effectiveness, and efficiency in health care for immigrants and minorities: The essential triad for improving health outcomes. *J Cult Divers* 12(3):99-106
- Avis M (1997) Incorporating patients' voices in the audit process. *Qual Health Care* 6:86-91.
- Betancourt JR, Gren AR, Carrillo JE, Park ER (2005) Cultural competence and health care disparities: Key perspectives and trends. *Health Aff (Millwood)* 24(2):499-505. doi:10.1377/hlthaff.24.2.499
- Cabral MV, Silva PA, Mendes H (2002) *Saúde e Doença em Portugal*. ICS, Lisboa
- Campayo JG, Broto CG, Buil B, Luengpo MG, Caballero L, Collazo F (2006) [Attitudes of Spanish doctors towards immigrant patients: an opinion survey]. *Actas Esp Psiquiatr* 34(6):371-376
- Culley L, Hudson N, Rapport F (2007) Using focus groups with minority ethnic communities: Researching infertility in British South Asian communities. *Qual Health Res* 17(1):102-112. doi: 10.1177/1049732306296506
- Dawson M, Gifford S (2001) Narratives, culture and sexual health: Personal life experiences of Salvadorian and Chilean women living in Melbourne. *Health* 5(4):403-423. doi: 10.1177/136345930100500401
- Dias S, Severo M, Barros H. (2008) Determinants of health care utilization by immigrants in Portugal. *BMC Health Serv Res* 8:207. doi:10.1186/1472-6963-8-207
- Eurostat (2006) *Europe in figures: Eurostat yearbook 2006-07*. Eurostat, Luxembourg

- 1  
2  
3  
4 Fennelly K (2004) Listening to the experts: Provider recommendations on the health needs of  
5  
6 immigrants and refugees. Malmö University, Malmö  
7  
8  
9 Geiger HJ (2006) Multicultural medicine and health disparities. *N Engl J Med* 355(2):216-217  
10  
11 Geiger HJ (2001) Racial stereotyping and medicine: The need for cultural competence. *Can Med*  
12  
13 *Assoc J* 164(12):1699-1700  
14  
15  
16 Goddard M, Smith P (2001) Equity of access to health care services: Theory and evidence from  
17  
18 the UK. *Soc Sci Med* 53:1149-1162. doi:10.1016/S0277-9536(00)00415-9  
19  
20  
21 Gonçalves A, Dias S, Luck M, Fernandes J, Cabral J (2003) Acesso aos Cuidados de Saúde de  
22  
23 Comunidades Migrantes. *Rev Port Saúde Pública* 21(1):55-64  
24  
25  
26 Green J, Thorogood N (2004) Qualitative methods for health research. Sage Publications,  
27  
28 London  
29  
30  
31 Grieco E (2002) Immigrant women. Migration Policy Institute, Washington DC  
32  
33  
34 Gurman TA, Becker D (2008) Factors affecting Latina immigrants' perceptions of maternal  
35  
36 health care: Findings from a qualitative study. *Health Care Women Int* 29(5):507-526.  
37  
38 doi:10.1080/07399330801949608  
39  
40  
41 Ingleby D, Chimienti M, Hatziprokopiou P, Ormond M, Freitas C (2005) The Role of Health in  
42  
43 Integration. In: Fonseca ML, Malheiros J (eds) Social integration and mobility: Education,  
44  
45 housing and health - IMISCOE Cluster B5, State of the art report. Centro de Estudos  
46  
47 Geográficos - Universidade de Lisboa, Lisboa, pp 101-137  
48  
49  
50 Jatrana S, Crampton P (2009) Primary health care in New Zealand: Who has access? *Health*  
51  
52 *Policy* 93(1):1-10. doi:10.1016/j.healthpol.2009.05.006  
53  
54  
55 Kidd P, Parshall M (2000) Getting the focus and the group: Enhancing analytical rigor in focus  
56  
57 group research. *Qual Health Res* 10:293-308. doi:10.1177/104973200129118453  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

- 1  
2  
3  
4 Krueger R, Casey M (2000) Focus groups: A practical guide for applied Research (3rd ed.). Sage  
5  
6 Publications, Thousand Oaks  
7  
8  
9 Kwok C, Sullivan G (2007) Health seeking behaviours among Chinese-Australian women:  
10  
11 Implications for health promotion programmes. *Health* 11(3):401-415.  
12  
13 doi:10.1177/1363459307077552  
14  
15  
16 Lane SD, Cibula DA (2000) Gender and health. In: Albrecht GL, Fitzpatrick R, Scrimshaw SC  
17  
18 (eds) *The handbook of social studies in health & medicine*. Sage Publications, London, pp  
19  
20 136–153  
21  
22  
23 LaVeist TA, Nickerson KJ, Bowie JV (2000) Attitudes about racism, medical mistrust and  
24  
25 satisfaction with care among African American and white cardiac patients. *Med Care Res*  
26  
27 *Rev* 57(suppl1):146-161. doi:10.1177/107755800773743637  
28  
29  
30  
31 Leduc N, Proulx M (2004) Patterns of health services utilization by recent immigrants. *J Immigr*  
32  
33 *Health* 6(1):15-27. doi:10.1023/B:JOIH.0000014639.49245.cc  
34  
35  
36 Lillie-Blanton M, Brodie M, Rowland D, Altman D, McIntosh M (2000) Race, ethnicity and the  
37  
38 health care system: Public perceptions and experiences. *Med Care Res Rev* 57:218-235.  
39  
40 doi:10.1177/107755800773743664  
41  
42  
43 Llácer A, Zunzunegui MV, del Amo J, Mazarrasa L, Bolumar F (2007) The contribution of a  
44  
45 gender perspective to the understanding of migrants' health. *J Epidemiol Community*  
46  
47 *Health* 61(Suppl II):ii4-ii10. doi:10.1136/jech.2007.061770  
48  
49  
50 Machado MC, Santana P, Carreiro M, Nogueira H, Barroso M, Dias A (2006) Iguais ou  
51  
52 diferentes? Cuidados de Saúde materno-infantil a uma população de imigrantes. Bial,  
53  
54 Lisboa  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

- 1  
2  
3  
4 Manfellotto D (2002) Case study 5: From misinformation and ignorance to recognition and care:  
5  
6 Immigrants and homeless in Rome, Italy in health systems confront poverty. WHO  
7  
8 Regional Office for Europe, Geneva  
9
- 10  
11 Marshall KJ, Urrutia-Rojas X, Mas FS, Coggin C (2005) Health Status and Access to Health  
12  
13 Care of Documented and Undocumented Immigrant Latino Women. Health Care Women  
14  
15 Int 26:916–936. doi:10.1080/07399330500301846  
16  
17
- 18  
19 Michaelsen J, Krasnik A, Nielsen A, Norredam M, Torres A (2004) Health professionals'  
20  
21 knowledge, attitudes, and experiences in relation to immigrant patients: a questionnaire  
22  
23 study at a Danish hospital. Scand J Public Health 32(4):287-295.  
24  
25  
26 doi:10.1080/14034940310022223  
27
- 28  
29 Morgan D (2002) Focus Group Interviewing. In: Gubrium JF, Holstein JA (eds) Handbook of  
30  
31 interview research: context and method. Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, pp 141-159  
32
- 33  
34 Norredam ML, Nielsen AS, Krasnik A (2007) Migrants' access to healthcare. Dan Med Bull  
35  
36 54(1):48-49  
37
- 38  
39 Parslow R, Jorm A, Christensen H, Jacomb P, Rodgers B (2004) Gender differences in factors  
40  
41 affecting use of health services: An analysis of a community study of middle-aged and  
42  
43 older Australian. Soc Sci Med 59:2121-2129. doi:10.1016/j.socscimed.2004.03.018  
44
- 45  
46 Pécoud A, Guchteneire P (2004) Migration, human rights and the United Nations: An  
47  
48 investigation into the low ratification record of the UN Migrant Workers Convention.  
49  
50 Global Commission on International Migration, Geneva  
51  
52
- 53  
54 Pulitzer R, Yoon J, Shi L, Hughes R, Regan J, Gaston M (2001) Inequality in America: The  
55  
56 contribution of health centers in reducing and eliminating disparities in access to care.  
57  
58 Med Care Res Rev 58(2):234-248. doi: 10.1177/107755870105800205  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65

- Ranji UR, Wyn R, Salganicoff A, Yu H (2007) Role of health insurance coverage in women's access to prescription medicines. *Women's Health Issues* 17:360-366.  
doi:10.1016/j.whi.2007.08.004
- Santos O, Biscaia A, Antunes AR, Craveiro I, Júnior A, Caldeira R, Charondière P (2007) Os Centros de Saúde em Portugal: A Satisfação dos Utentes e dos Profissionais. Ministério da Saúde – Missão para os Cuidados de Saúde Primários, Lisboa
- Scheppers E, Dongen E, Dekker J, Geertzen J, Dekker J (2006) Potential barriers to the use of health services among ethnic minorities: A review. *Fam Pract.* 23(3):325-348.  
doi:10.1093/fampra/cmi113
- Scrimshaw SC, Zambrana RE, Dunkel-Schetter C (1997) Issues in Latino women's health: Myths and challenges. In: Ruzek S, Olesen V, Clarke A (eds) *Women's health: Complexities and differences*. Ohio State University Press, Columbus, pp 329–347
- SEF (2008) Relatório de Imigração, Fronteiras e Asilo 2008. Departamento de Planeamento e Formação do SEF, Lisboa
- Sofaer S, Firminger K (2005) Patient perceptions of the quality of health services. *Annu Rev Public Health* 26:513-519. doi:10.1146/annurev.publhealth.25.050503.153958
- Staniszewska S, Henderson L (2004) Patients evaluations of their health care: The expression of negative evaluation and the role of adaptive strategies. *Patient Educ Couns* 55:185-192.  
doi:10.1016/j.pec.2003.09.002
- Stronks K, Ravelli C, Reijneveld A (2001) Immigrants in the Netherlands: Equal access for equal needs? *J Epidemiol Community Health* 55(10):701-707. doi:10.1136/jech.55.10.701
- UNFPA (2006) A state of the world population: A passage to hope. United Nations Population Fund, New York

1  
2  
3  
4 UNFPA/IOM (2006) Female migrants: Bridging the gaps throughout the life cycle.  
5

6 UNFPA/IOM, New York  
7

8  
9 United Nations (2005) Trends in total migrant stock: The 2005 revision, CD-Rom  
10

11 Documentation. United Nations, New York  
12

13  
14 Williams B, Coyle J, Healy D (1998) The meaning of patient satisfaction: An explanation of  
15

16 high reported levels. Soc Sci Med 47:1351-1359. doi:10.1016/S0277-9536(98)00213-5  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65



Table 1: Socio-demographic characteristics of participants.

		Africans	Brazilians	Total
Total		20	15	35
Age (years)	21-29	2	8	10
	30-39	8	4	12
	40-45	10	3	13
Educational level (years)	≤ 6	16	-	16
	7-9	3	-	3
	10-12	1	12	13
	≥ 13	-	3	3
Immigration status	Portuguese nationality	3	1	4
	Legal status	13	9	22
	Undocumented	4	5	9
Length of stay (years)	2-5	1	11	12
	6-10	7	4	11
	11-15	3	-	3
	≥ 16	9	-	9
Employment status	Employed	18	15	33
	Unemployed	2	-	2